

**Information note to the Press**  
**(Press Release No. 51/ 2009/QoS)**  
**Telecom Regulatory Authority of India**

**For Immediate release**

Tel. No.:011-23230404  
Fax: 011-23213036  
E-mail: [advqos@traigov.in](mailto:advqos@traigov.in)  
Website: [www.traigov.in](http://www.traigov.in)

**TRAI Releases Report of the independent agencies engaged for the Objective Assessment of Quality of Service and Customer Satisfaction Survey of Telecom Services in UP(West) including Uttrakhand service area.**

New Delhi, 22<sup>nd</sup> .May, 2009 - TRAI engaged M/s. IMRB International as independent agency for conducting an objective assessment of the Quality of Service provided by Basic Service (Wire line) cellular mobile telephone service providers and broadband service providers and Voluntary Organization in Interest of Consumer Education(VOICE) for conducting subjective customer satisfaction surveys for assessing the customers perception of the service and to assess the implementation and effectiveness of Telecom Consumers Protection and Redressal of Grievances Regulations, 2007.

**2. Key Findings of the independent agency on Quality of Service**

Telecom service providers are not meeting Customer satisfaction benchmark. The Authority demands better treatment to the customers particularly in resolving the grievances of customers by the service providers. TRAI carried out a customer satisfaction survey through VOICE for UP(West) including Uttrakhand Service Area during the period from September-November, 2008. The survey covered 3600 mobile subscribers, 2802 fixed line subscribers and 1998 broadband subscribers across the various districts/ cities of UP(West) including Uttrakhand spread across various geographies and customer strata.

**2.1 Proportion of satisfied customers on various customer service perception parameters**

**2.1.1 Cellular Mobile Telephone Service:** In UP(West) including Uttrakhand service area the survey of customers satisfaction of service of service providers, namely, Bharti-Airtel, Vodafone Essar, Idea Cellular, BSNL, Reliance Communications and Tata Teleservices Ltd. (TTSL), was conducted. The gradation on "Satisfaction" score i.e. scores of "Very Satisfied" and "Satisfied" is given in Table-1 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to the Billing Performance (Pre Paid & Post-paid), Network Performance, Maintainability, Supplementary Services and also Overall Satisfaction across the service providers. The main reasons identified, in respect of dissatisfaction relating to accuracy of billing/charging performance of various service providers, is that the charges not levied as per the subscribed tariff plan, tariff plan changed without information and charges levied on account of the services not made/used/subscribed.

**Table-1 (Cellular Mobile Telephone Service – UP(West) including Uttrakhand Service Area)**

Name of Service Providers (UP(West) including Uttrakhand sample Size)	Percentage(%) of Customers satisfied with							Overall Satisfaction
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	
		Post paid	Prepaid					
Bharti Airtel (600)	94.2	91.5	86.8	93.9	96.7	95.8	92.5	97.3
Vodafone (600)	92.0	78.8	90.7	94.6	83.9	97.4	94.7	95.3
IDEA (600)	87.6	68.7	86.6	85.9	91.5	98.2	93.9	96.3
BSNL (600)	96.6	81.6	91.5	94.0	86.2	90.2	89.8	94.8
Reliance (600)	92.3	71.9	90.8	90.6	89.7	97.1	91.4	89.5
TTSL (600)	89.5	88.2	80.3	92.3	89.4	90.5	90.1	87.5

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by VOICE based on sample of 3600 subscribers

**2.1.2 Basic Telephone Service (wire line):** In UP(West) including Uttrakhand service area the survey of customer’s satisfaction of service of service providers, namely, BSNL, Bharti-Airtel, Reliance Communications and TTSL was conducted. The gradation on “Satisfaction” score i.e. scores of “Very Satisfied” and “Satisfied” is given in Table-2 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to the Billing Performance, Network Performance, Maintainability, Supplementary services and also Overall Satisfaction across the service providers.

**Table-2 (Basic Telephone Service – UP(West) including Uttrakhand Service Area)**

Name of Service Providers (UP(West) including Uttrakhand sample Size)	Percentage(%) of Customers satisfied with							Overall Satisfaction
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	
		Post paid	Prepaid					
BSNL Uttarakhand (600)	94.6	93.2	76.0	93.7	88.6	82.1	73.5	92.2
Airtel (585)	97.3	88.5	82.0	95.9	90.6	81.3	63.4	86.3
BSNL UP(West) including Uttrakhand (600)	96.9	87.6	75.9	98.1	92.6	84.4	81.1	89.8
Reliance (564)	98.3	90.0	84.8	96.3	90.4	66.1	72.7	80.7
TTSL (453)	95.0	88.4	71.3	94.8	87.0	75.6	74.6	72.4

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by VOICE based on sample of 2802 subscribers

**2.1.3 Broadband Service:** In UP(West) including Uttrakhand service area the survey of customers' satisfaction of service of service providers, namely, Bharti-Airtel, BSNL and Reliance Communications was conducted. The gradation on "Satisfaction" score i.e. scores of "Very Satisfied" and "Satisfied" is given in Table-3 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to Billing Performance (Prepaid) and Help services across the service providers.

**Table-3 (Broadband Service – UP(West) including Uttrakhand Service Area)**

Name of Service Providers (UP(West) including Uttrakhand sample Size)	Percentage(%) of Customers satisfied with							Overall Satisfaction
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintain ability	Supple mentary Services	
		Post paid	Prepaid					
Bharti Airtel (600)	88.5	98.8	80.0	85.0	89.6	89.0	98.0	90.0
BSNL UP(West) including Uttrakhand (600)	91.1	97.8	77.8	82.9	91.1	90.0	78.9	88.3
Rel.com (198)	99.7	97.7	87.5	61.6	84.6	89.4	94.0	87.4
BSNL Uttarakhand (600)	95.4	98.2	94.7	94.5	91.8	84.3	97.7	87.5

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by M/s VOICE based on sample of 1998 subscribers

## 2.2 Objective Assessment/Audit of Quality of Service performance

**2.2.1 Cellular Mobile Telephone Service:** In UP(West) including Uttrakhand service area the audit of quality of service data of service providers namely, Reliance Communications (RCOM), Idea Cellular, Bharti Airtel, Tata Teleservices, BSNL and Vodafone was conducted. The audit for Cellular Mobile Telephone Service Providers was conducted at their respective MSCs in the UP(West) including Uttrakhand circle apart from Reliance Communication whose audit was conducted at their central NOC, Mumbai. Service Provider's performance in respect of cellular mobile telephone service, based on one month data is given in Annex-'1'. The areas of concerns i.e. parameters, for which benchmarks is not met by the service providers, are identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below:

- Connections with good voice quality
- Call answered by the operators
- Cells exceeding 3% call drop

**2.2.1.1 Drive Test:** The drive tests were conducted in the ciites Aligarh, Dehradun, and Meerut to verify parameters like Call Drop Rate, Call Set-up Success Rate, Blocked

Call Rate and Percentage of Connections with Good Voice Quality. The areas of concerns (i.e. parameters) are identified as below:

- Blocked Call Rate
- Call Drop Rate
- Connections with good voice quality

**2.2.2 Basic Telephone Service (wire line):** In UP(West) including Uttrakhand service area the audit of quality of service data of basic service providers, namely, Bharti Airtel and BSNL was conducted. Basic (Wire line) services audit for UP(West) including Uttrakhand circle broadly indicates that both of the service providers are not meeting the benchmarks for some of the Parameters. Service Provider's performance in respect of basic service (wire line) based on one month data is given in Annex-'2'. The areas of concerns i.e. parameters, for which benchmarks is not met by the service providers, are identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below:

- Fault incidences
- Fault repair

**2.2.3 Broadband Service:** In UP(West) including Uttrakhand service area the audit of quality of service data of service providers, namely, Bharti Airtel, BSNL and Sify were conducted by independent agency M/s.IMRB International. The audit for Broadband Service Providers was conducted at their respective network operating centre/point of presence (POPs) in the UP(West) including Uttrakhand circle. Service Provider's performance based on one month data is given in Annex -'3'. The report reveals that most of the service providers are meeting the benchmarks of all the parameters.

**3. Telecom Consumers Protection and Redressal of Grievances score:** The results of the survey reveal that more than 96.2% of the basic telephone, 97.5% of Cellular mobile telephone and 97.9% of Broadband service customers, claimed to be aware of the Call Centre while the awareness of nodal officer and appellate authority for redressing grievances is negligible. 89.1% of basic telephone, 96.7% of the Cellular mobile telephone and 95.7% of Broadband service customers who had lodged complaints said that they were satisfied with the system of resolving their complaints by the call centers. Service providers need to take effective steps for bringing awareness about three stage redressal mechanism including contact details of Nodal Officers/ appellate authority to improve customers satisfaction.

**4. Value Added Services:** The Authority had entrusted the survey agency to undertake survey about the provision of value added services without explicit consent by all the service providers. The reports of the survey agency reveal the following position about provision of value added services without explicit consent of the consumers;-

**Question: Did the service provider have your explicit consent before providing the chargeable value added service such as ring tone, emails / GPRS, voice mail etc. ?**

Name of Service Provider	Total customer surveyed, who have given specific response	Yes		No	
		Count	%age	Count	%age
Bharti Airtel	212	175	82.5	37	17.5
Vodafone	41	34	82.9	7	17.1
Idea	39	23	59.0	16	41.0
BSNL	40	34	85.0	6	15.0
Reliance	98	75	76.5	23	23.5
TTSL	45	37	82.2	8	17.8
<b>Total</b>	<b>475</b>	<b>378</b>	<b>79.58%</b>	<b>97</b>	<b>20.42%</b>

5. The survey revealed that about 20.42% customers were provided value added services without their explicit consent. It was also revealed that M/s Idea Cellular has the highest number (41%) of such responses of provisioning of Value added service without explicit consent of the customers, M/s Idea being the highest with 41%

6. The detailed Report on Quality of Service – Audit/Objective Assessment and Customer Satisfaction Survey, including grievance redressal mechanism, conducted during the period August, 2008 to November, 2008 is placed at TRAI Website ([www.traigov.in](http://www.traigov.in)).

---

Contact Address in case any clarification required:  
M.C.Chaube,  
Advisor (Quality of Service), TRAI  
Mahanagar Door Sanchar Bhawan,  
Jawahar Lal Nehru Marg (Old Minto Road),  
New Delhi -110002, Tel. No. 23230404/23220708

Authorized to issue: Advisor (QOS)

**Service provider performance report based on one month data verification:  
Cellular Mobile Services**

Parameters	Benchmark	Reliance CDMA	IDEA	Bharti Airtel	TATA	BSNL-GSM	Vodafone
<b>Accumulated downtime for community isolation</b>	< 24 hrs.	0.00	20.23	8.17	1.28	0.00	0.00
<b>Call Set Up Success Rate (CSSR)</b>	> 95%	99.48%	97.66%	95.65%	97.73%	82.03%	99.80%
<b>Service Access Delay*</b>	9 to 20 seconds (< = 15 seconds for 100 calls)	3.80	10.91	9.20	7.80	10.50	9.00
<b>Blocked Call Rate</b>							
<i>SDCCH /Paging Channel Congestion</i>	<1%	0.00%	0.32%	0.98%	0.00%	0.54%	0.93%
<i>TCH Congestion</i>	< 2%	0.52%	1.10%	1.47%	0.09%	1.88%	1.51%
<b>Call drop rate</b>	< 3%	0.83%	1.45%	1.07%	0.99%	1.33%	1.04%
<b>Percentage connections with good voice quality*</b>	> 95%	94%	94%	94%	98%	72%	93%
<b>Service coverage*</b>							
<i>In door</i>	>-75dbm	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
<i>In vehicle</i>	>-85dbm						
<i>Out door - in city</i>	>-95dbm						
<b>POI congestion</b>	< 0.5%	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
<b>Calls answered electronically</b>							
Percentage calls answered within 20 seconds	80%	99%	100%	100%	100%	99%	100%
Percentage calls answered within 40 seconds	95%	99%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
<b>Calls Answered by the operator</b>							
Percentage calls answered within 60 seconds	80%	94%	73%	92%	95%	80%	95%
Percentage calls answered within 90 seconds	95%	96%	92%	93%	97%	95%	96%
<b>Billing Complaints</b>							
Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<0.1%	0.09%	0.25%	0.04%	0.09%	0.00%	0.05%
Percentage billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	Not Applicable	100%
Period of refunds/payments due to customers from the date of resolution of complaints	<4 weeks	100%	100%	DNP	53%	Not Applicable	100%

\*Details pertaining to these are obtained through operator assisted drive tests. Results of the drive tests are explained in greater detail in critical findings

\*\* Methodology not in line with QoS

■ Figures provided on All India basis

■ Not meeting the benchmark

B\*mark = TRAI Benchmark, DNA = Details not available,

## Annexure-2

### Service provider performance report based on one month data verification – Basic Services (Wireline)

S.no	Parameters	B/mark	Bharti	BSNL
1	Provision of telephone after registration of demand			
1.1	Connections completed within 7 days	100%	100%	97%
2	Fault incidence/clearance statistics			
3	Fault incidences(No. of faults/100 subscribers/month)	<3	4	10.5
3.1	Faults repaired within 24 hours	>90%	98%	63%
3.2	Faults repaired within three working days	100%	100%	92%
4	Mean time to Repair (MTTR)	<8 hours	7	24
5	Call Completion Rate (CCR)	>55%	93%	48%
6	Metering and billing credibility			
6.1	Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<0.1%	0.01%	0.05%
6.2	%age of billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	100%	93%
7	Customer care/helpline promptness			
7.1	<u>Shift requests attended</u>			
	Shift requests attended within 3 days	95%	97%	77%
7.2	<u>Closure request attended</u>			
	Closure within 24 hours	95%	100%	15%
7.3	<u>Supplementary (additional) service requests attended</u>			
	Additional facility provided within 24 hours	95%	99%	78%
8	Response time to customer for assistance			
8.1	% age call answered through IVR in 20 seconds	80%	100%	100%
	% age call answered through IVR in 40 seconds	100%	100%	100%
8.2	% age calls answered by operator in 60 seconds	80%	97%	DNA
	% age calls answered by operator in 90 seconds	95%	99%	DNA
9	Time taken for refund of deposits after closure			
9.1	%age cases where refund received within 60 days	100%	100%	100%

\*\* Methodology not in line with QoS

■ Figures provided on All India basis

■ Not meeting the benchmark

B/mark = TRAI Benchmark, DNA = Details not available

### Service provider performance report based on one month data Verification – Broadband Services

S.No	Parameters	B'mark	Bharti	BSNL	Sify
1	<b>Service provisioning uptime</b>				
1.1	Total connections registered		448	489	81
1.2	Percentage connections provided within 15 days	100%	100%	100%	100%
2	<b>Fault repair restoration time</b>				
2.1	Total number of faults registered/calls made		1008	1007	24
2.2	Percentage faults repaired by next working days	> 90%	98%	90%	96%
2.3	Percentage faults repaired within three working days	99%	98%	100%	100%
3	<b>Billing performance</b>				
3.1	Total bills generated		11921	13540	Prepaid
3.2	Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<2%	0.01%	0.05%	
3.3	%age of billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	100%	100%	
3.4	Time taken for refund of deposits after closure	100%	100%	100%	
4	<b>Customer care/helpline assessment</b>				
4.1	Percentage calls answered within 60 seconds	> 60%	86%	97%	100%
4.2	Percentage calls answered within 90 seconds	>80%	92%	100%	100%
5	<b>Bandwidth utilisation/Throughput</b>				
5.1	Total number of intra network links tested		4 links from Agra to Delhi, 4 links from Meerut to Delhi	23 BRAS, TI 24, T2624, DSLAM 5960	412
5.2	Total number if intra network links crossing 90%		0	0	0
	<b>Upstream Bandwidth (ISP Node to NIXI/NAP/IGSP)</b>				
5.3	Total number of upstream links		3	141	27
5.4	Number of links > 90%		0	8	0
5.5	Percentage bandwidth utilised on upstream links	<80%	79%	70%	79%
6	<b>Broadband download speed</b>	>80%	Complied	Complied	Complied
7	<b>Service availability/uptime</b>	>98%	99.99%	100.00%	100.00%
8	<b>Packet loss</b>	<1%	1%	0%	0%
9	<b>Network Latency</b>				
9.1	POP/ISP Node to NIXI to IGSP	<120msec	<80	<120	<30
9.2	ISP node to NAP port	<350msec	<150	Complied	<300

\*\* Methodology not in line with QoS

Figures provided on All India basis

Not meeting the benchmark

B'mark = TRAI Benchmark, DNA = Details not available