

Information note to the Press
(Press Release No. 50 /2009/QoS)
Telecom Regulatory Authority of India

For Immediate release

Tel. No.:011-23230404
Fax: 011-23213036
E-mail: advqos@trai.gov.in
Website: www.trai.gov.in

TRAI Releases Report of the independent agencies engaged for the Objective Assessment of Quality of Service and Customer Satisfaction Survey of Telecom Services in Rajasthan service area.

New Delhi, 21st May, 2009 - TRAI engaged M/s. IMRB International as independent agency for conducting an objective assessment of the Quality of Service provided by basic and cellular mobile telephone service providers and broadband service providers and Voluntary Organisation in Interest of Consumer Education (VOICE) for conducting subjective customer satisfaction surveys for assessing the customers' perception of the service and to assess the implementation and effectiveness of Telecom Consumers Protection and Redressal of Grievances Regulations, 2007.

2. Key Findings of the independent agency on Quality of Service

Telecom service providers are not meeting Customer satisfaction benchmark. The Authority demands better treatment to the customers particularly in resolving the grievances of customers by the service providers. TRAI carried out a customer satisfaction survey through VOICE for Rajasthan Service Area during the period from September - November, 2008. The survey covered 4200 mobile subscribers, 2706 fixed line subscribers and 2053 broadband subscribers across the various districts/ cities of Rajasthan spread across various geographies and customer strata.

2.1 Proportion of satisfied customers on various customer service perception parameters

2.1.1 Cellular Mobile Telephone Service: In Rajasthan service area the survey of customers satisfaction of service of service providers, namely, Bharti-Airtel, Vodafone Essar, Idea Cellular, BSNL, Reliance Communications, Tata Teleservices (TTSL), and Shyam Telelink was conducted. The gradation on "Satisfaction" score i.e. scores of "Very Satisfied" and "Satisfied" is given in Table-1 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to the Billing Performance (Post-paid), Network Performance, Supplementary Services and Overall Satisfaction across the service providers. The main reason identified, in respect of dissatisfaction relating to accuracy of billing /charging performance of various service providers, is that the charges not levied as per the subscribed tariff plan, charges levied on account of the services not made/used/subscribed and detail of itemized usages charges not given.

Table-1 (Cellular Mobile Telephone Service – Rajasthan Service Area)

Name of Service Providers (Sample Size)	Percentage (%) Customers Satisfied With							
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	Overall Satisfaction
		Post-paid	Pre-paid					
Bharti Airtel (600)	96.0	86.4	92.8	91.3	97.1	97.7	94.8	96.8
Vodafone (600)	96.6	85.2	96.1	95.0	94.1	96.7	91.9	94.3
IDEA (600)	99.2	73.9	95.0	95.5	93.6	97.0	95.3	93.7
BSNL (600)	98.3	79.0	93.4	94.8	96.4	97.3	89.5	95.5
Reliance (600)	96.2	78.4	96.5	96.5	93.7	95.8	95.0	93.3
TTSL (600)	99.2	84.1	95.0	95.2	96.8	98.3	96.9	96.0
Shyam Telelink (600)	95.5	91.4	98.0	96.9	98.0	97.8	85.0	98.0

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by VOICE based on sample of 4200 subscribers

2.1.2 Basic Telephone Service (wire line): In Rajasthan service area the survey of customer's satisfaction of service of service providers, namely, Bharti-Airtel, BSNL, Reliance Communications, Tata Teleservices (TTSL) and Shyam Telelink was conducted. The gradation on "Satisfaction" score i.e. scores of "Very Satisfied" and "Satisfied" is given in Table-2 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to the Billing Performance (Postpaid), Help Services, Network Performance, Maintainability, and Supplementary Services across the service providers.

Table-2 (Basic Telephone Service – Rajasthan Service Area)

Name of Service Providers (Sample Size)	Percentage (%) Customers Satisfied With							
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	Overall Satisfaction
		Postpaid	Prepaid					
Bharti Airtel (587)	98.4	83.6	96.1	83.6	77.9	94.8	96.9	99.0
BSNL (600)	100	95.6	97.0	82.5	80.3	70.9	84.6	98.7
Reliance (581)	99.5	85.0	90.0	80.4	74.9	90.9	75.2	99.1
TTSL (340)	100.0	77.5	94.7	81.3	74.6	87.2	75.4	99.1
Shyam Telelink (598)	99.0	93.9	100.0	78.0	78.7	86.9	91.5	99.3

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by VOICE based on sample of 2706 subscribers

2.1.3 Broadband Service: In Rajasthan service area the survey of customers satisfaction of service of service providers namely, Bharti-Airtel, BSNL, Reliance Communications (RCOM), Shyam Telelinks and VSNL (Tata) was conducted. The gradation on “Satisfaction” score i.e. scores of “Very Satisfied” and “Satisfied” is given in Table-3 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to the, Billing Performance (Pre Paid), Help services, Network Performance, Maintainability and Overall Satisfaction across the service providers.

Table-3 (Broadband Service – Rajasthan Service Area)

Name of Service Providers (Sample Size)	Percentage (%) Customers Satisfied With							Overall Satisfaction
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	
		Post paid	Prepaid					
Bharti Hexacom (600)	92.4	97.8	83.3	73.4	92.6	95.3	93.4	87.7
BSNL (600)	91.8	97.6	88.9	90.6	89.7	78.1	85.6	92.7
Reliance (165)	94.9	96.6	66.7	76.6	70.6	96.3	65.4	65.5
Shyam Telelink (437)	95.5	97.5	66.7	82.6	90.3	77.8	88.2	89.7
VSNL(Tata) (251)	97.5	96.4	57.1	81.8	70.5	72.9	85.2	65.7

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by M/s VOICE based on sample of 2053 subscribers

2.2 Objective Assessment/Audit of Quality of Service performance

2.2.1 Cellular Mobile Telephone Service: In Rajasthan service area the audit of quality of service of service providers, namely, Vodafone, Shyam Telelink, Tata Teleservices Ltd, Idea Cellular Ltd, BSNL, Bharti Hexacom and Reliance Communications was conducted. The audit for Cellular Mobile Telephone Service Providers was conducted at their respective MSCs in the Rajasthan circle apart from Reliance Communication whose audit was conducted at their central NOC, Mumbai. Service Provider’s performance in respect of cellular mobile telephone service based on one month data is given in Annex-`1’. The areas of concerns i.e. parameters, for which benchmark is not met by the service providers, are identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below:

- SDCCH/TCH congestion
- Connections with good voice quality
- Cells exceeding 3% call drop

2.2.1.1 Drive Test: The drive tests were conducted at Jaipur, Bhilwara and Mount Abu cities to verify parameters like Call Drop Rate, Call Set-up Success Rate, Blocked Call Rate and Percentage of Connections with Good Voice Quality. The areas of concerns (i.e. parameters) are identified as below:

- Blocked Call Rate
- Call Drop Rate
- Connections with good voice quality

2.2.2 Basic Service (wire line): In Rajasthan service area the audit of quality of service of basic service providers namely, Bharti Airtel, BSNL, Reliance Communications (RCOM) and Shyam Telelink was conducted. Basic service (Wire line) audit for Rajasthan circle broadly indicates that the service providers are not meeting the benchmarks for some of the Parameters. Service Provider's performance in respect of basic service (wire line) based on one month data is given in Annex-`2'. The areas of concerns i.e. parameters, for which benchmark is not met by the service providers, are identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below:

- Fault incidences
- Fault repair

2.2.3 Broadband Service: In Rajasthan service area the audit of quality of service data of service providers, namely, Bharti Airtel, BSNL, Sify, VSNL (Tata), Reliance Communications (RCOM) and Shyam Telelink was conducted by independent agency M/s. IMRB International. The audit for Broadband Service Providers was conducted at their respective network operating centre/point of presence (POPs) in the Rajasthan circle. Service Provider's performance based on one month data is given in Annex -`3'. The report reveals that most of the service providers are not meeting the benchmark of some of the parameters as specified by TRAI. The areas of concerns i.e. parameters, for which benchmark is not met by the service providers, are identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below.

- Faults repair
- Billing Performance

3. Telecom Consumers Protection and Redressal of Grievances score: The results of the survey reveal that 89.9% of cellular mobile telephone, 99.4% of Basic Telephone and 98.8% of Broadband service customers claimed to be aware of the Call Centre while the awareness of nodal officer and appellate authority for redressing grievances is negligible. 87.2% of basic telephone, 76.6% of the Cellular mobile telephone and 84.3% of Broadband service customers who had lodged complaints said that they were satisfied with the system of resolving their complaints by the call centers. Service providers need to take effective steps for bringing awareness about three stage redressal mechanism including contact details of Nodal Officers/ appellate authority to improve customers satisfaction.

4. Value Added Services: The Authority had entrusted the survey agency to undertake survey about the provision of value added services without explicit consent by all the service providers. The reports of the survey agency reveal the following position about provision of value added services without explicit consent of the consumers:-

Question: Did the service provider have your explicit consent before providing the chargeable value added service such as ring tone, emails / GPRS, voice mail etc. ?					
Name of Service Provider	Total customer surveyed, who have given specific response	Yes		No	
		Count	%age	Count	%age
Bharti Airtel	149	51	34.2	98	65.8
Vodafone	152	37	24.3	115	75.7
Idea	116	36	31.0	80	69.0
BSNL	129	54	41.9	75	58.1
Reliance	127	38	29.9	89	70.1
TTSL	119	29	24.4	90	75.6
Shyam Telelink	160	76	47.5	84	52.5
Total	952	321	33.72%	631	66.28%

5. The result of the survey revealed that about 66.28% customers were provided value added services without their explicit consent. It is also revealed that M/s Vodafone has the highest number (75.7%) of such responses of provisioning of Value added service without explicit consent of the customers.

6. **The detailed Report on Quality of Service – Audit/Objective Assessment and Customer Satisfaction Survey, including grievance redressal mechanism, conducted during the period August, 2008 to November, 2008 is placed at TRAI Website (www.traai.gov.in).**

Contact Address in case any clarification required:
M.C.Chaube,
Advisor (Quality of Service), TRAI
Mahanagar Door Sanchar Bhawan,
Jawahar Lal Nehru Marg (Old Minto Road),
New Delhi -110002, Tel. No. 23230404/23220708

Authorized to issue: Advisor (QOS)

Annexure-1

Service provider performance report based on one month data verification: Cellular Mobile Telephone Services

Parameters	Benchmark	Vodafone	Shyam Telelink	TATA	IDEA	BSNL	Bharti Hexacom	RCOM
Accumulated downtime for community isolation	< 24 hrs.	6.85	12.95	0.00	19.52	23.67	22.68	0.60
Call Set Up Success Rate (CSSR)	> 95%	99.32%	98.73%	98.40%	98.85%	97.80%	93.64%	99.49%
Service Access Delay*	9 to 20 seconds (< = 15 seconds for 100 calls)	9.7 sec	5.8 sec	7.3 sec	3.13 sec	7.2 sec	14.04 sec	3.56 sec
Blocked Call Rate								
<i>SDCCH/Paging Channel Congestion</i>	<1%	0.33%	0.00%	0.00%	0.32%	0.18%	2.22%	0.00%
<i>TCH Congestion</i>	< 2%	0.22%	0.00%	0.09%	0.42%	1.27%	2.76%	0.51%
Call drop rate	< 3%	0.97%	0.45%	0.84%	1.31%	2.20%	1.71%	0.59%
Percentage connections with good voice quality*	> 95%	96%	99%	97%	92%	91%	91%	99%
Service coverage*								
<i>In door</i>	>-75dbm	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
<i>In vehicle</i>	>-85dbm							
<i>Out door - in city</i>	>-95dbm							
POI congestion	< 0.5%	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
Calls answered electronically								
Percentage calls answered within 20 seconds	80%	100%	DNP	100%	100%	98%	100%	99%
Percentage calls answered within 40 seconds	95%	100%	DNP	100%	100%	98%	100%	99%
Calls Answered by the operator								
Percentage calls answered within 60 seconds	80%	96%	DNP	95%	98%	66%	95%	92%
Percentage calls answered within 90 seconds	95%	98%	DNP	97%	100%	77%	96%	95%
Billing Complaints								
Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<0.1%	0.08%	0.09%	0.09%	0.09%	0.09%	No Billing Complaints received	0.09%
Percentage billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%		100%
Period of refunds/payments due to customers from the date of resolution of complaints	<4 weeks	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%		100%

*Details pertaining to these are obtained through operator assisted drive tests. Results of the drive tests are explained in greater detail in critical findings

** Methodology not in line with QoS

Figures provided on All India basis

Not meeting the benchmark

B*mark = TRAI Benchmark, DNA = Details not available

**Service provider performance report based on one month data verification –
Basic Services (Wireline)**

S.no	Parameters	B'mark	Bharti	BSNL	RCOM	Shyam Telelink
1	Provision of telephone after registration of demand					
1.1	Connections completed within 7 days	100%	100%	89%	100%	98%
2	Fault incidence/clearance statistics					
3	Fault incidences(No. of faults/100 subscribers/month)	<3	3.3	7.71	2.9	2.27
3.1	Faults repaired within 24 hours	>90%	95%	56%	98%	78%
3.2	Faults repaired within three working days	100%	100%	99%	98%	78%
4	Mean time to Repair (MTTR)	<8 hours	7.0	6.9	5.4	7.1
5	Call Completion Rate (CCR)	>55%	91%	85%	DNA	92%
6	Metering and billing credibility					
6.1	Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<0.1%	0.06%	0.09%	0.07%	0.09%
6.2	%age of billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	100%	99%	100%	100%
7	Customer care/helpline promptness					
7.1	<u>Shift requests attended</u>					
	Shift requests attended within 3 days	95%	99%	70%	NA	100%
7.2	<u>Closure request attended</u>					
	Closure within 24 hours	95%	100%	68%	99%	100%
7.3	<u>Supplementary (additional) service requests attended</u>					
	Additional facility provided within 24 hours	95%	99%	84%	100%	98%
8	Response time to customer for assistance					
8.1	% age call answered through IVR in 20 seconds	80%	100%	100%	100%	DNA
	% age call answered through IVR in 40 seconds	100%	100%	100%	100%	DNA
8.2	% age calls answered by operator in 60 seconds	80%	97%	81%	97%	DNA
	% age calls answered by operator in 90 seconds	95%	99%	95%	99%	DNA
9	Time taken for refund of deposits after closure					
9.1	%age cases where refund received within 60 days	100%	100%	98%	100%	NA

(*Note: For BSNL data pertains to the sample 5% of exchanges audited during the period of to September to November 2008, whereas for rest of the operators figures pertain to all the exchanges present in the circle)

** Methodology not in line with QoS ■ Figures provided on All India basis ■ Not meeting the benchmark B'mark = TRAI Benchmark, DNA = Details not available

Service provider performance report based on one month data Verification – Broadband Services

S. No	Parameters	B'mark	Bharti	BSNL	Sify	VSNL	RCOM	Shyam
1	Service provisioning							
1.1	Total connections		795	3581	54	No new registrations	85	1608
1.2	Percentage connections provided within 15 days	100%	100%	96%	100%		99%	100%
2	Fault repair restoration time							
2.1	Total number of faults registered/calls made		2075	8621	59	222	193	6044
2.2	Percentage faults repaired by next working day	> 90%	99%	71%	90%	92%	91%	78%
2.3	Percentage faults repaired within three working days	99%	100%	100%	100%	99%	99%	100%
3	Billing performance							
3.1	Total bills generated		11906	7844	Prepaid	347	678	17078
3.2	Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<2%	0.00%	2.82%		0.29%	0.29%	0.91%
3.3	%age of billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	No billing complaints	88%		100%	100%	100%
3.4	Time taken for refund of deposits after closure	100%		92%	No cases	NA	100%	No cases
4	Customer care/helpline assessment							
4.1	Percentage calls answered within 60 seconds	> 60%	86%	81%	96%	95%	94%	Details not maintained
4.2	Percentage calls answered within 90 seconds	>80%	92%	95%	100%	97%	96%	
5	Bandwidth utilisation/Throughput							
5.1	Total number of intra network links tested		57	23 BRAS, TI 24, T2624,DSLAM	412	16	No Core Distribution Router present in Rajasthan circle	65
5.2	Total number of intra network links crossing 90%		10	0	0	0		0
	Upstream Bandwidth (ISP Node to NIXI/NAP/IGSP)							
5.3	Total number of upstream links		3 (Links physically)	141	27	50	1(NIXI)	2
5.4	Number of links > 90%		0	8	0	0	0	0
5.5	Percentage bandwidth utilised on upstream links	<80%	79%	70%	79%	60%	50%	63%
6	Broadband download speed	>80%	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
7	Service availability/uptime	>98%	99.92%	100.00%	100.00%	97.72%	99.02%	99.89%
8	Packet loss	<1%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
9	Network Latency							
9.1	POP/ISP Node to NIXI to IGSP	<120msec	31	Complied	<30	Complied	Complied	35
9.2	ISP node to NAP port	<350msec	102	Complied	<300	Complied	Complied	151

** Methodology not in line with QoS

Figures provided on All India basis

Not meeting the benchmark

B'mark = TRAI Benchmark, DNA = Details not available